

Reinvigorating Journal Club

John Epling, MD, MEd, Mary Beth Sweet, MD, Karen Perkins, MD
Virginia Tech Carilion SOM, Roanoke, VA
jwepling@carilionclinic.org

The first record of a journal club was that founded in 1875 by Sir William Osler at McGill University for the purchase and distribution of periodicals to which he could not afford to subscribe as an individual.

- Dirschl D, Tornetta P, Bhandari M. Designing, Conducting, and Evaluating Journal Clubs in Orthopaedic Surgery. *Clin Orthop Relat R*. 2003;413(413):146.

Upon completion of this session, participants should be able to:

1. *Critique the usual successes and challenges of residency journal clubs*
2. *Discuss journal club innovations published in the medical education literature*
3. *Implement new educational and assessment techniques into their own journal clubs.*

Introductions and Journal Club Poll (keep it brief):

1. Your Name
2. Your Program/Institution
3. Do you use a Journal Club?
4. Do you teach medical students, residents or both in your journal club(s)?
5. Do learners pick their own articles?
6. Do other faculty attend/participate?
7. Are you...
 - a. Happy with journal club and want to share your success?
 - b. Satisfied and want to see what's out there?
 - c. Dissatisfied...changes needed STAT!
 - d. Just eating breakfast at a (hopefully) interesting table?

Literature Scan:

- Systematic Reviews/Major Articles

Title	Citation	Comments
Using the Journal Club to Teach and Assess Competence in Practice-based Learning and Improvement: A Literature Review and Recommendation for Implementation	November 2005, Survey of Ophthalmology 50(6):542-8	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• the use of a structured review checklist,• explicit written learning objectives• a formalized meeting structure and process.
Deenadayalan,	Journal of	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• regular and anticipated meetings

Grimmer–Somers, Prior, Kumar. How to run an effective journal club: a systematic review	Evaluation in Clinical Practice. 2008;14(5):898–911.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • mandatory attendance • clear long- and short-term purpose • appropriate meeting timing and incentives • a trained journal club leader to choose papers and lead discussion • circulating papers prior to the meeting • using the internet for wider dissemination and data storage • using established critical appraisal processes • summarizing journal club findings
Honey C, Baker J. Exploring the impact of journal clubs: A systematic review	Nurse Education Today. 2011;31(8):825–31	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • multidisciplinary work based journal club
Roberts M, Perera M, Lawrentschuk N, Romanic D, Papa N, Bolton D. Globalization of Continuing Professional Development by Journal Clubs via Microblogging: A Systematic Review	J Med Internet Res; 2015; 17(4):e103	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Twitter journal clubs • “Global reach”
Alguire P. A Review of Journal Clubs in Postgraduate Medical Education	J Gen Intern Med. springer; 1998;13(5):347–53	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Goal: teach critical appraisal skills, not necessarily keep up with lit. • Participation factors: mandatory attendance, availability of food, and perceived importance by the program director • Residents taught critical appraisal: pay more attention to methods, are more skeptical, increased knowledge of epi/biostats • Reading guidelines: ? useful for teaching critical appraisal skills, ? increased resident satisfaction.
Ahmadi N, McKenzie M, MacLean A, Brown C, Mastracci T, McLeod R, et al. Teaching Evidence Based Medicine to Surgery Residents-Is Journal Club the Best Format? A Systematic Review of the Literature	J Surg Educ; 2012; 69(1): 91–100	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • journal clubs lead to improved knowledge of the EBM process • impact on patient care is unknown. • Journal clubs preferred way of teaching critical appraisal skills • unclear which elements are most important for resident learning.

Commentaries/Ideas:

<i>Locations/Setting</i>	faculty member's home, electronic/online, videoconference, social media
--------------------------	---

<i>Timing</i>	Workday, evenings
<i>Faculty participation</i>	moderation useful, increased faculty participation desired
<i>Formats</i>	article(s) of the day, clinical question-based, debate, structured review/checklist, team-based learning, reading article in session, “flipped classroom”, writing “intentionally-flawed” manuscripts of simple experiments, using preprints & feedback to authors,
<i>Food/Drink</i>	Yes (socialization, attendance)
<i>Attendance</i>	mandatory
<i>Goals</i>	teach EBM/critical appraisal, keep up with current literature, teach research, teach biostats/epi, fostering of collegiality/socialization, development of professional identity, link quality improvement
<i>Evaluation methods</i>	Level 1... Level 2... Level 3 - fictitious article, essay format CA Level 4 - no data

Shared Experiences:

- VTCsOM Family Medicine Monthly JC - <http://bitly.com/VTCFMRJC>
 - Topic of the didactic session - faculty selects AFP article
 - Intern presents AFP article
 - 2nd year presents original research article from ref list of AFP article
 - 3rd year presents systematic review or guideline from ref list
 - Written peer feedback
 - Solicit response to peer feedback
- Others?

Challenges:

- Learner schedules
- Learner willingness to do pre-work
- Faculty participation
- Relevance to work
- What is the real purpose? Critical appraisal? Critical Thinking? Socialization of literature reading? Mindlines?
- Does specialty matter? What should FM learners be reading?
- Other?

Ideas and Notes: